

1 Q And just to show you what I mean, if we  
2 turn to the second page of the packet.  
3 A Okay.  
4 Q This document refers to an incident that  
5 happened on March 29 of '17; correct, off to the  
6 left --  
7 A Yes --  
8 Q -- of the --  
9 A -- according to the incident date.  
10 Q And the Purpose of Review that we see  
11 about a quarter of the way down, the box for Random  
12 is checked; correct?  
13 A Correct.  
14 Q Now, the incident that we are here for,  
15 January 22nd of '18, that was captured on MVR as  
16 well; correct?  
17 A It wouldn't have been captured on MVR, no.  
18 Q It was captured on an MVR of other  
19 responding officers; correct?  
20 A Later it was.  
21 Q I think Butschky or someone with a name  
22 like that?  
23 A What?  
24 Q Do you recall the names of the officers  
25 who responded later whose MVR did capture part of

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 the incident?  
2 A I don't recall.  
3 Q You don't know who they were? Has  
4 Millville Police Department, to your knowledge, ever  
5 done a review of the MVR that was prepared in  
6 connection with this incident?  
7 A I have no idea.  
8 Q I'd like to turn to the tabbed page, and  
9 you had referred to this page earlier, I believe,  
10 and the supervisor's signature at the bottom of this  
11 tabbed page is who?  
12 A It looks like Sergeant John Redden.  
13 Q That was someone who was also involved in  
14 your training?  
15 A He's a sergeant. They don't -- they will  
16 answer questions if you have them, but they're not  
17 specifically involved in your training unless you  
18 need a sergeant to train you.  
19 Q Okay. So since we know this isn't a  
20 training related document, is this page we are  
21 looking at part of an annual review?  
22 A Looks like it would be.  
23 Q And feel free to back up if you need to  
24 place this in context, and I am showing you the  
25 pages in the order that I got them. Returning to

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

75

1 the tabbed page on 11/9/17, do you know if that was  
2 part of a larger document?  
3 A Looks like it would be.  
4 Q Are you subject to annual performance  
5 reviews?  
6 A Yes.  
7 Q And when do they take place typically?  
8 A In the fall.  
9 Q In the fall?  
10 A Yes.  
11 Q So if we return, if you wouldn't mind, to  
12 the tabbed page -- you're also welcome to page  
13 through if you want --  
14 A Uh huh --  
15 Q -- but I am not asking you about those  
16 documents. Returning to the tabbed page, you just  
17 indicated that annual reviews take place in the  
18 fall. Is --  
19 A Okay --  
20 Q -- this tabbed page part of your annual  
21 review for 2017?  
22 A Yes.  
23 Q Did you have an annual review for 2018?  
24 A Yes.  
25 Q And have you reviewed a printed document

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

76

1 that was generated as a result of that review?  
2 A Yes.  
3 Q And you signed off on it?  
4 A Yes.  
5 Q And if you wanted to take a look at that  
6 document how would you do it?  
7 A I would ask for it.  
8 Q You would ask for it in hard copy?  
9 A Yeah.  
10 Q Is it --  
11 A I can -- I can either ask for it or log  
12 into my account and print it out myself if you want  
13 to.  
14 Q Okay. I appreciate that. So your  
15 employment related records, such as that tabbed page  
16 dated 11/9/17, they are available to you on a  
17 server?  
18 A Yes.  
19 Q I just want to focus on a bit of the text  
20 on this tabbed page. He handles victims and  
21 suspects with respect and I have not received a  
22 citizen complaint against him for demeanor, although  
23 at times he can have an abrasive manner with  
24 truculent suspects.  
25 That sentence that I just read to you,

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 although at times he can have an abrasive manner  
2 with truculent suspects, did you discuss that with  
3 the sergeant?

4 A No.

5 Q Did you know what he meant by truculent  
6 suspects?

7 A Are you asking if I discussed it before he  
8 wrote it or after he wrote it?

9 Q Well, I understood from your answer that  
10 you never discussed it with him at all; correct?

11 A No.

12 Q And I am just asking, since you signed  
13 this page, if you knew what he meant by truculent  
14 suspects?

15 A I would -- at the time I think I looked it  
16 up; what truculent meant.

17 Q And what did you learn?

18 A I don't remember the exact definition, but  
19 from -- also from the context it can be from  
20 difficult suspects.

21 Q And --

22 A Uncooperative, unruly, however you want to  
23 describe it, and -- it all fits.

24 Q And encountering uncooperative and unruly  
25 suspects is part of police work; correct?

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 A Yes.

2 Q Something that can happen to you every  
3 day.

4 A Yes.

5 Q And now that we have talked about this  
6 document and the reference to truculent suspects, do  
7 you have any better or improved recollection of  
8 training you may have received on dealing with  
9 uncooperative and truculent suspects?

10 A Like I said before, in a subjective  
11 manner. You can use constructive authority, command  
12 presence.

13 Q Constructive authority; what do you mean  
14 by that?

15 A Constructive authority can mean drawing  
16 your firearm and pointing it at them. It can mean  
17 raising your voice.

18 Q So drawing your firearm and pointing it at  
19 them --

20 A That's constructive authority, yes.

21 Q And that would be appropriate with a  
22 truculent suspect?

23 A Yes. Sometimes it is.

24 MR. REYNOLDS: Note --

25 THE WITNESS: Like I said, it's all

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

79

1 subjective.

2 MR. REYNOLDS: Note my objection. You're  
3 taking the one sentence out of context without  
4 reading the next sentence. He has a very good  
5 command presence when in a hostile situation  
6 and keeps his composure.

7 MR. MAURER: Counsel --

8 MR. REYNOLDS: I think, in fairness, that  
9 sentence that you have relied upon has been  
10 read out of context.

11 MR. MAURER: Counsel, what you have just  
12 done is a speaking objection and the type that  
13 Hall versus Clifton Precision says shouldn't  
14 happen, and, as you know, Counsel, I preceded  
15 my questioning on that sentence with a sentence  
16 referring to Patrolman Chard's treating victims  
17 and suspects with respect --

18 MR. REYNOLDS: Correct, but --

19 MR. MAURER: -- and I had every intention  
20 of moving on, and I can ask about sentences one  
21 at a time.

22 MR. REYNOLDS: No.

23 MR. MAURER: This isn't trial or the rule  
24 of completeness and it's really not appropriate  
25 to give a speaking objection, but enough of

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

80

1 that.

2 MR. REYNOLDS: I just feel it was read out  
3 of context. That's all.

4 MR. MAURER: I read it verbatim in a  
5 document that Patrolman Chard --

6 MR. REYNOLDS: Okay --

7 MR. MAURER: -- has had a chance to look  
8 at.

9 BY MR. MAURER:

10 Q And so we don't leave anything out at all,  
11 the last sentence of the narrative, if I could  
12 direct your attention, it says, he is not timid with  
13 using force when necessary; correct?

14 A Correct.

15 Q You would agree with that?

16 A Yes.

17 Q If your lawyer asks you to provide your  
18 2018 evaluation would you be able to locate that in  
19 the manner you described for us?

20 A If I wanted to.

21 Q And if your lawyer asks you to do that you  
22 would do it?

23 MR. REYNOLDS: Well, that goes to --

24 THE WITNESS: Yes --

25 MR. REYNOLDS: -- attorney/client

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR



1 communications.  
 2 THE WITNESS: Yes.  
 3 MR. MAURER: Well, I didn't ask about  
 4 communications. We will cross that bridge in a  
 5 written request.  
 6 MR. REYNOLDS: Okay.  
 7 (Discussion off the record.)  
 8 BY MR. MAURER:  
 9 Q Patrolman, I want to -- we have been  
 10 talking a lot about documents and I want to move on  
 11 to show you one of the videos that has been produced  
 12 in discovery in this case --  
 13 A Uh huh --  
 14 Q -- and, to do that, I just want to fire up  
 15 this laptop that I showed you earlier and go over to  
 16 your side of the table. I am going to set up a  
 17 little post at the corner there, and I'm not going  
 18 to get in your way, and your attorney is welcome to  
 19 join me. If you wouldn't just mind moving your  
 20 water bottle. Thank you. I will stay out of your  
 21 way, and I am going to be starting and stopping this  
 22 video.  
 23 The video has been exchanged in discovery  
 24 and, obviously --  
 25 A I can't see it --

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 Q -- we're going to be talking about  
 2 something that is on a screen. Can you see that?  
 3 A Yes, I can see that.  
 4 Q And what we see in the still image is  
 5 North High Street driving south?  
 6 A Yes.  
 7 Q And there's a McDonald's on the left and  
 8 this is the road that leads to the intersection of  
 9 Foundry Street?  
 10 A Yes.  
 11 Q Okay. I want to, with that as background,  
 12 start this up.  
 13 (Video started; video interrupted.)  
 14 BY MR. MAURER:  
 15 Q I just stopped the video, Officer, and --  
 16 A Okay. And I can't see it so --  
 17 Q Okay. Well, feel free to adjust it in any  
 18 way necessary so you can see it.  
 19 A Okay.  
 20 Q And what we see here is the intersection  
 21 of North High Street and Foundry; correct?  
 22 A Yes.  
 23 Q And we see a Rite-Aid on one side of North  
 24 High and we see a 7/11 on the other; correct?  
 25 A Yes.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

83

1 Q And we see a parked Millville police car.  
 2 A Yes.  
 3 Q That was your patrol vehicle?  
 4 A Yes.  
 5 Q And were you with anybody else in that  
 6 vehicle that day?  
 7 A No.  
 8 Q And the officer in the Hi-Vis safety vest  
 9 is yourself; correct?  
 10 A Yes.  
 11 Q And North High Street is closed at  
 12 Foundry; right?  
 13 A Yes.  
 14 Q And why was that?  
 15 A An officer involved shooting one block  
 16 south.  
 17 Q What do you mean by officer involved  
 18 shooting?  
 19 A An officer had to exercise the action of  
 20 shooting a suspect.  
 21 Q Okay. An officer --  
 22 A Does that clear it up for you?  
 23 Q Sure. An officer shot a suspect at a  
 24 location further south --  
 25 A Yes --

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

84

1 Q -- of High Street.  
 2 A Yes.  
 3 Q And, for that reason, the street had been  
 4 closed --  
 5 A Correct --  
 6 Q -- for investigation?  
 7 A Yes.  
 8 Q And was that a fatality?  
 9 A Yes.  
 10 Q Do you know the name of the suspect who  
 11 was shot?  
 12 A Yes.  
 13 Q And what was it?  
 14 A Edward Gandy.  
 15 THE COURT REPORTER: I'm sorry. Gandy,  
 16 G-A-N-D-Y?  
 17 THE WITNESS: Yes, ma'am.  
 18 BY MR. MAURER:  
 19 Q Were you involved at all in any attempt to  
 20 apprehend Mr. Gandy?  
 21 A No.  
 22 Q You came to the scene afterwards?  
 23 A Yes.  
 24 Q And Mr. Carpenter is driving a red pick-up  
 25 truck at the time this video is shot; correct?

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 A Correct.  
 2 Q And we can see a little bit of a red hood  
 3 of the vehicle?  
 4 A Yes.  
 5 Q What's the first thing you remember about  
 6 Mr. Carpenter's pick-up truck?  
 7 A As he approached, I see him holding a cell  
 8 phone in the window, a very large cell phone.  
 9 That's all -- that's what I see coming at me.  
 10 Q Okay. Just, for the record, you held your  
 11 right arm up.  
 12 A Yes.  
 13 Q And you saw Mr. Carpenter holding a very  
 14 large cell phone?  
 15 A Yes.  
 16 Q Now, he wasn't looking at his cell phone;  
 17 correct?  
 18 MR. REYNOLDS: Objection.  
 19 THE WITNESS: He was using a cell phone.  
 20 BY MR. MAURER:  
 21 Q Understood. More precisely, he wasn't  
 22 texting with it; correct?  
 23 A I don't know what he was doing.  
 24 Q Well --  
 25 A He was holding it up is all I know.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 Q Holding it up away from --  
 2 A I don't know what he was doing with it and  
 3 -- continue.  
 4 Q Holding it up away from himself?  
 5 A As far as I can see, he was holding it up  
 6 in the window. I don't know what he's doing.  
 7 Q Well, Officer, I realize that motorists in  
 8 New Jersey are not supposed to text and neither are  
 9 they in any other jurisdiction. I am aware of it.  
 10 You --  
 11 A Well, they're not -- let me correct you.  
 12 They're not supposed to use any handheld electronic  
 13 device while driving.  
 14 Q Understood. My question, Officer, is you  
 15 have seen motorists, unfortunately, text while  
 16 driving; correct?  
 17 A Yes.  
 18 Q Not a good idea under any circumstances;  
 19 correct?  
 20 A It's worse than drunk driving.  
 21 Q As I've heard, and Mr. Carpenter wasn't  
 22 doing that; correct?  
 23 A I don't know what he was doing, like I  
 24 said already.  
 25 Q Well, if he's holding the phone away from

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

87

1 him with his right hand he couldn't have been  
 2 texting; correct?  
 3 A Like I said, I don't know what Mr.  
 4 Carpenter was doing inside his vehicle with that  
 5 phone.  
 6 Q Why don't we go back to the video? I am  
 7 going to start it up again and I'll probably -- and  
 8 I want to make sure you can see it. Can you see it  
 9 now?  
 10 A No.  
 11 MR. MAURER: Respectfully, is there  
 12 something we can do to turn the lights on, turn  
 13 them off?  
 14 MR. REYNOLDS: Well, he's looking into the  
 15 sunlight or daylight --  
 16 THE WITNESS: Continue, please. I can see  
 17 it.  
 18 MR. REYNOLDS: Okay.  
 19 MR. MAURER: Okay. My co-Counsel may --  
 20 THE WITNESS: Continue.  
 21 MR. MAURER: All right. We will continue.  
 22 (Video started; video interrupted.)  
 23 BY MR. MAURER:  
 24 Q I want to stop it right there. You just  
 25 made a gesture with your right arm and hand?

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

88

1 A Uh huh.  
 2 Q What did you intend by that gesture?  
 3 A Put the phone down.  
 4 Q Put the phone down. The gesture that you  
 5 just made, you know, with your right hand and arm  
 6 going downward, did you learn that in your training  
 7 as a police officer?  
 8 A That's pretty universally used, you know.  
 9 Q To mean what?  
 10 A Put the phone down. People understand  
 11 that.  
 12 Q And what do you recall Mr. Carpenter  
 13 doing, if anything, in response to that?  
 14 A Not putting it down.  
 15 Q Mr. Carpenter wasn't driving in an unsafe  
 16 rate of speed; was he?  
 17 A From what I recall, no.  
 18 (Video started; video interrupted.)  
 19 BY MR. MAURER:  
 20 Q You made another gesture, as you can see,  
 21 with your right hand and arm. What did you mean by  
 22 that gesture?  
 23 A I believe I repeated the same gesture.  
 24 Put it down.  
 25 MR. MAURER: Play it again --

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR



(Video started --

THE WITNESS: Nobody had a problem with that all day --

-- video interrupted.)

BY MR. MAURER:

Q I just stopped at a point where we can hear a sound on the video. You tried to open the door of his truck; correct?

A Because he refused to stop and talk to me. He refused to put his window down like I asked him to. He refused to talk to me. He said, no, I don't have to.

Q I understand that's what your recollection is, Officer, but it's true that you tried to open the door of his pick-up truck; correct?

A Correct.

Q Is that something you were trained to do as a police officer?

A It's something that happens.

Q So if a vehicle doesn't stop in a manner that you perceive as quick enough, your officer training has instructed you to try to open the door of the vehicle?

A There was more to that communication than -- than you allow.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

Q I don't mean to cut anything short and we can watch the entire thing. Why did you try to open the door of Mr. Carpenter's pick-up truck?

A Because I asked him if the door was unlocked because he refused -- he said he couldn't hear me, for one, and I don't know why it's not captured on this video.

Q What do you say it is not captured?

A He said he couldn't hear me. I tried to talk to him. He wouldn't talk to me. He refused to stop. He wouldn't talk to me and you can hear him on his video saying he doesn't have to. I tell him put the window down. He said no.

Q So, Officer --

A So he refuses to do what I asked him to do.

Q And, because of that, you tried to open the door of the truck?

A I asked him if the door was unlocked at one point. I don't know why it's not captured on this video.

Q And I'm sorry if I'm not being clear, Officer, but --

A Well, if he's going to refuse to put his window down, then open the door so I can talk to

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

91

you. All I wanted to do is talk to the man. That's it.

Q So your testimony is that you did try to open the passenger side door of the pick-up --

A I think we established that, yes.

Q And you're saying it's because you wanted to talk to him?

A Correct.

(Video started; video interrupted.)

BY MR. MAURER:

Q Now, I just heard a sound of you pounding on the truck; correct?

A Yes.

Q So after you tried to open the door you then let go of the handle; correct?

A Correct.

Q And then you pounded on the truck.

A I slapped the back window.

Q And your purpose in that?

A Let him know.

Q Let him know what?

A He's, obviously, not listening to reason. He's not listening to verbal commands.

Q His windows were rolled up.

A Yes, his windows were rolled up. He

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

92

refuses to do what he's supposed to do.

Q It's January 22nd; right?

A And, obviously, I'm not in a winter coat if that's what you're getting at.

Q Well, sir -- Officer, I apologize. It's not unusual for people in January to be driving with their windows up.

A Correct.

Q It's not unusual in August. They could have the air conditioning on.

A Well, it's not unusual for people to put their windows down to speak to an officer either.

Q So your assessment is that during that period of time, and the record will speak for itself how short it is, you would have expected the operator of the pick-up truck to roll his window down?

A Yes.

Q Now --

A People were doing it all day.

Q Okay. As an officer -- I'm sorry. Keep going.

A I was at that traffic post for several hours; had no problem communicating with anyone. People's windows don't work we open the door and

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 speak. It's very easy to do; very reasonable to do.  
 2 Any reasonable person is going to stop when asked to  
 3 by a police officer.  
 4 Q Now, Officer, at the point you saw Mr.  
 5 Carpenter holding up his cell phone and not putting  
 6 it away, your plan at that point was to stop the  
 7 vehicle?  
 8 A Correct.  
 9 Q And issue a citation for cell phone use?  
 10 A Correct, and explain to him what his  
 11 mistake is.  
 12 Q Now, when you're stopping a vehicle you  
 13 don't want the vehicle to come to a sudden  
 14 screeching halt in the middle of the roadway;  
 15 correct?  
 16 A Sir, that's a closed intersection under my  
 17 control. If I need to stop a vehicle in the middle  
 18 of that intersection, I will, which I did all day  
 19 long.  
 20 Q I will try the question again. When you  
 21 form an intention to stop a vehicle --  
 22 A Uh huh --  
 23 Q -- you want that vehicle to come to a  
 24 smooth, controlled stop; correct?  
 25 A Yes. He was going slow enough to stop

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 when I told him to.  
 2 Q You don't want him to slam the brakes in  
 3 the middle of the roadway.  
 4 A Correct.  
 5 Q You want him to pull over.  
 6 A Sir, maybe you don't understand what I  
 7 just told you. That intersection is under my  
 8 control. If I tell someone to stop, they can stop  
 9 right there where I told them to stop.  
 10 Q So you're telling us that was your  
 11 intention --  
 12 A Yes --  
 13 Q -- to have Mr. Carpenter come to a sudden  
 14 stop in the middle of the roadway --  
 15 A It's a closed intersection. What I need  
 16 to do is what I need to do.  
 17 Q And what is it that you needed to do?  
 18 A I think we established that already.  
 19 Q You said you need to do what you need to  
 20 do. What is it?  
 21 A Stop the vehicle.  
 22 Q I am going to start the tape again.  
 23 (Video started; video interrupted.)  
 24 BY MR. MAURER:  
 25 Q What we just saw shows Mr. Carpenter

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

95

1 pulling his truck off to the side as you commanded  
 2 him to do; correct?  
 3 A After he refused.  
 4 Q Your perception of what preceded it is  
 5 your perception, Officer --  
 6 A It --  
 7 Q -- but you would agree with --  
 8 A It's clearly shown he refused.  
 9 Q You would agree with me that what we just  
 10 saw --  
 11 A After he refused and realized there was a  
 12 problem he pulled over.  
 13 Q In response to your command; correct?  
 14 A I don't know why he pulled over.  
 15 Q Well, there wasn't any other officer at  
 16 the scene; was there? Just you.  
 17 A Just me.  
 18 (Video started --  
 19 THE WITNESS: I don't know what his  
 20 intentions are pulling over --  
 21 -- video interrupted.)  
 22 THE WITNESS: -- there's -- people have  
 23 other intentions so I don't know if his  
 24 intention was to pull over because I told him  
 25 to or to pull over to pull out a gun and kill

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

96

1 me.  
 2 BY MR. MAURER:  
 3 Q Officer, are you telling us that you were  
 4 in fear of your life after you gave a command to  
 5 David Carpenter to pull over?  
 6 A I'm telling you anything can happen on a  
 7 traffic stop. Anything can happen throughout the  
 8 course of the day as a police officer.  
 9 Q Well, Officer, you'd agree that, while  
 10 anything can happen, certain things are more likely  
 11 than others to an experienced officer; correct?  
 12 A What are your certain things that are more  
 13 likely? It's already an irregular traffic stop.  
 14 Q Officer, as you yourself indicated, you  
 15 had no issues with any vehicles going through this  
 16 intersection; correct? The controlled intersection  
 17 controlled by you.  
 18 A Everyone stopped when I asked them to.  
 19 Everyone spoke to me when I asked them to. Everyone  
 20 understood what I had to say to them. Everyone else  
 21 that was holding a cell phone did not -- did not  
 22 tell me that I don't have the authority or they  
 23 don't have to put it down like Mr. Carpenter did.  
 24 Q I just want to take that part of your  
 25 testimony, Patrolman. You're telling us that on the

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR



1 incident date, while this intersection is under your  
2 control, sole control, that other motorists had cell  
3 phones out as well?

4 A Correct.

5 Q And you didn't issue citations for any of  
6 those people; did you?

7 A I don't have to.

8 Q I understand that you don't have to --

9 A Most people didn't give me a problem.  
10 They were very respectful, courteous, did what I  
11 asked them to do, and moved on. The #1 purpose of  
12 having a police controlled intersection with a high  
13 traffic area, which the high traffic isn't shown in  
14 this area right now, is to keep people moving out of  
15 the area.

16 Q Exactly.

17 A If there's a problem then we have to deal  
18 with it.

19 Q And to keep the traffic moving you don't  
20 want --

21 A So --

22 Q -- Mr. Carpenter to come to a sudden stop  
23 in the middle of the roadway.

24 A There was no one behind him, no one else  
25 coming through the intersection, so, that being

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 said, yes, I want him to stop where I tell him to  
2 stop.

3 MR. REYNOLDS: Note my objection to  
4 sudden. He hasn't used that phrase. You have  
5 -- or that term.

6 MR. MAURER: And I can do that.

7 MR. REYNOLDS: Well --

8 BY MR. MAURER:

9 Q Patrolman, we're going to go back to the  
10 video. We have stopped at the point where I believe  
11 we agreed that Mr. Carpenter is pulling over, and I  
12 am just going to play it again.

13 (Video started; video interrupted.)

14 BY MR. MAURER:

15 Q That's yourself; correct --

16 A No, keep going.

17 Q Well --

18 A Rewind it and keep going.

19 Q Patrolman, I will do that, but -- I know  
20 you want to take control of this deposition just as  
21 you did at that intersection, but the rules of  
22 evidence don't allow it, sir.

23 I stopped it simply to establish that  
24 that's you in the view --

25 A Obviously --

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

99

1 Q -- correct, and at that point the window  
2 of Mr. Carpenter's truck is down; correct?

3 A The driver's side window is down at that  
4 point.

5 Q Right. Just as it's supposed to be.

6 A Okay.

7 Q He didn't hole himself up in his vehicle  
8 with the windows closed; correct?

9 A I asked him to put the window down before  
10 and he didn't, and I was at the passenger side of  
11 the vehicle, so...

12 Q And --

13 A That would have been the reasonable thing  
14 to do. Stop when asked to and speak when asked to.

15 Q Do you know how old this pick-up truck  
16 was?

17 A Not offhand, no.

18 Q Did you know if it had power windows or  
19 not?

20 A Nope.

21 Q You'd agree if it didn't that it takes  
22 longer to winch a window down with a manual control?

23 A That's also why I asked if the door was  
24 unlocked.

25 Q So the window is down and this verbal

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

100

1 discussion, and I --

2 A Because I can easily speak through an open  
3 door as well as an open window.

4 Q And just, since you want to go back to  
5 that, Patrolman, attempting to open the door of a  
6 moving vehicle to speak with the operator, is that  
7 something that you were taught in police academy?

8 A Not in the police academy.

9 Q Were you taught it --

10 A I was --

11 Q -- anywhere else?

12 A I was expecting him to stop when ordered  
13 to; okay?

14 Q Officer, my question --

15 A That's the bottom line.

16 Q My question is pretty basic. Opening the  
17 door of a moving vehicle --

18 A No --

19 Q -- to speak to the operator you were not  
20 taught that at academy?

21 A No.

22 Q And you're not aware of any printed  
23 material that indicates that's an acceptable police  
24 procedure; correct?

25 A Not that I recall.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 Q Let's watch the rest of the vehicle.  
 2 (Video started; video interrupted.)  
 3 BY MR. MAURER:  
 4 Q I want to play it one more time from the  
 5 beginning as it sounded like you wanted to do,  
 6 Patrolman.  
 7 (Video started --  
 8 BY MR. MAURER:  
 9 Q -- and I just started it from the  
 10 beginning --  
 11 -- video interrupted.)  
 12 BY MR. MAURER:  
 13 Q According to the counter, what we just  
 14 watched was 50 seconds long. I can show you the  
 15 counter. Can you see it?  
 16 A Okay.  
 17 Q All right. Patrolman, you claimed after  
 18 that happened that you were dragged across the  
 19 intersection; correct?  
 20 A Yes.  
 21 Q Where in the video that we just saw does  
 22 it show you being dragged across the intersection?  
 23 A The part where I had a hold of the door  
 24 handle.  
 25 Q The part where you had a hold of the door

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 handle --  
 2 A What do you want? The exact second in the  
 3 video?  
 4 Q Well, we can do that.  
 5 A Is that what you want?  
 6 Q Sure. We can do that.  
 7 A Please.  
 8 Q I'm sorry. What did you say? Jesus?  
 9 A Let's go. Get on with it.  
 10 Q Okay.  
 11 (Video started --  
 12 MR. REYNOLDS: I thought he said please,  
 13 but --  
 14 -- video interrupted.)  
 15 BY MR. MAURER:  
 16 Q I just stopped it at the point where we  
 17 heard the sound --  
 18 A Okay --  
 19 Q -- corresponding to you trying to open the  
 20 door; correct? Accurate?  
 21 A Should be.  
 22 Q Were you being dragged at that point?  
 23 A Not at that point.  
 24 Q I am going to start that again --  
 25 A You can keep --

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

103

1 Q -- can you tell me when you started to be  
 2 dragged, and we're now --  
 3 A Well, it should start at exactly this  
 4 point, actually.  
 5 Q Okay. We're at 28 seconds --  
 6 A -- I mean.  
 7 (Video started --  
 8 THE WITNESS: And it should have --  
 9 -- video interrupted.)  
 10 BY MR. MAURER:  
 11 Q Were you being dragged then?  
 12 A Yes.  
 13 Q Now we're at second 30.  
 14 A Okay.  
 15 (Video started --  
 16 THE WITNESS: There it just ended --  
 17 -- video interrupted.)  
 18 BY MR. MAURER:  
 19 Q Well, Patrolman, this is sec -- this is  
 20 second 31.  
 21 A Okay.  
 22 Q You indicated the dragging would have  
 23 started at 28. What we see in 31 is you're on your  
 24 feet; correct?  
 25 A Yes.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

104

1 Q You're not on your side. You're not on  
 2 your back. You're standing up.  
 3 A Okay.  
 4 Q And you were standing during this entire  
 5 encounter with Carpenter's truck; correct?  
 6 A Okay.  
 7 Q Correct?  
 8 A Yes.  
 9 Q But you told the grand jury you had been  
 10 dragged --  
 11 A Yes --  
 12 Q -- right? And you indicated in the police  
 13 reports that you had been dragged?  
 14 A Yes.  
 15 Q So, according to you, the dragging  
 16 happened while you were still on your feet?  
 17 A Lucky for me I stayed on my feet.  
 18 Q While you were being dragged?  
 19 A Yes.  
 20 Q So your feet are sliding over the road  
 21 surface?  
 22 A The vehicle was dragging me along and I'm  
 23 keeping up with it with what appears to be -- what  
 24 -- three or four seconds.  
 25 Q Well, we started at 28 and now we're at 31

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR



1 --  
2 A That would be three seconds.  
3 Q That would be three seconds.  
4 MR. REYNOLDS: Or four.  
5 MR. MAURER: Counsel, I will send you Hall  
6 versus Clifton Precision.  
7 MR. REYNOLDS: I've read it.  
8 BY MR. MAURER:  
9 Q Three, four seconds, and you're claiming  
10 you were dragged while you were still on your feet  
11 walking alongside of the vehicle, and that's what  
12 drag means to you?  
13 A What else does it mean?  
14 Q As a result of what you say is being  
15 dragged did you sustain any injuries?  
16 A Yes.  
17 Q To what parts of your body?  
18 A Shoulder, arm.  
19 Q Shoulder, arm. Hand?  
20 A Hand, yeah.  
21 Q All in that three or four seconds?  
22 A Yes.  
23 Q And you would agree with me that none of  
24 those injuries would have happened if you hadn't  
25 grabbed on to the door handle; correct?

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 A Also, none of those injuries would have  
2 happened if your client would have stopped when  
3 ordered to, and did what he was told, and wasn't  
4 using a handheld electronic device like he wasn't  
5 supposed to be.  
6 Q So I appreciate your offering the  
7 additional information but, I'm allowed to take this  
8 in pieces, and if you hadn't reached out and opened  
9 that door handle, none of these injuries that you  
10 have claimed would have occurred; correct?  
11 A You don't know that.  
12 Q You don't know that. Why don't you know  
13 that, sir?  
14 A I could have been injured in another way  
15 too.  
16 Q You could have been injured in another  
17 way. But were you?  
18 A No. I was injured then.  
19 Q Injured then.  
20 A Uh huh.  
21 Q Officer, is there anything you can't do  
22 today that you could do before the incident date?  
23 A Excuse me?  
24 Q Is there anything you can't do today that  
25 you could do before the incident date?

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 A Not to my knowledge.  
2 Q I want to take one more look at this  
3 video, and unless your Counsel wants to look at it  
4 again, this is probably my last time.  
5 Officer, are you familiar with how to  
6 operate -- like to operate a laptop like this one --  
7 A Yes --  
8 Q -- and if you want to stop it you just  
9 press here in the lower left hand corner? What I  
10 would like you to do, if you don't mind, is stop the  
11 video at the point where you believe you told David  
12 Carpenter to stop his vehicle. Would you do that or  
13 you can tell me to do it and I'll do it.  
14 A Well, if I could see it.  
15 Q Okay. Better?  
16 A Go ahead.  
17 Q How about you tell me to stop and I'll  
18 stop it at the point where you say you told  
19 Carpenter to stop his vehicle.  
20 (Video started --  
21 THE WITNESS: It looks like right there.  
22 -- video interrupted.)  
23 BY MR. MAURER:  
24 Q Right there? This is second marked 22.  
25 Can you tell me what you're doing in that image that

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 is conveying a stop command? When you start it you  
2 can just click on --  
3 A I know how to work it.  
4 Q Okay. Thank you.  
5 MR. MAURER: So, just for the record, we  
6 have turned over the controls to Patrolman  
7 Chard.  
8 (Video started; video interrupted.)  
9 THE WITNESS: Well, he's, obviously,  
10 refusing to listen and --  
11 MR. REYNOLDS: Speak up.  
12 BY MR. MAURER:  
13 Q Patrolman, just so --  
14 (Video started --  
15 THE WITNESS: He's, obviously, refusing to  
16 listen and obey my commands --  
17 -- video interrupted.)  
18 BY MR. MAURER:  
19 Q So, Officer, my question to you was that  
20 at what point, and I asked you to stop the video at  
21 the point where you told David Carpenter to stop his  
22 vehicle.  
23 (Video started --  
24 THE WITNESS: Well, for some reason, it's  
25 not captured. I remember telling him verbally

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 and I remember him telling me he can't hear me.  
 2 BY MR. MAURER:  
 3 Q Well --  
 4 -- video interrupted.)  
 5 THE WITNESS: So I don't know where that  
 6 is on this video.  
 7 BY MR. MAURER:  
 8 Q Patrolman, if you -- you can keep running  
 9 it or we can stop and I can ask you more questions.  
 10 It's up to you.  
 11 Officer, would you agree with me that a  
 12 video that was filmed on the date and at the time is  
 13 a more reliable indicator of what actually happened  
 14 than somebody's memory?  
 15 A May or may not be.  
 16 MR. REYNOLDS: Objection.  
 17 BY MR. MAURER:  
 18 Q You don't have any facts in your knowledge  
 19 that indicate this video was altered in any way; do  
 20 you?  
 21 A Is that what you're suggesting?  
 22 Q No, not at all. To my knowledge, it's not  
 23 altered one bit. I am asking if you think it was.  
 24 A To my knowledge, some of it is missing  
 25 where it didn't get captured, me telling him to stop

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 and him saying I can't hear you, and me saying roll  
 2 your window down and him refusing, and me asking if  
 3 the door is unlocked.  
 4 Q So your testimony is all of that --  
 5 A It happened in a very, very, very quick  
 6 amount of time.  
 7 Q And your belief is that it's somehow  
 8 missing from this video I just played for you?  
 9 A Appears to be.  
 10 Q Now, aside from the verbal, did you see in  
 11 the video we just looked at any signal, any, say,  
 12 command with your hands or arms that he stop the  
 13 vehicle?  
 14 A I don't see it. Well, actually, it looks  
 15 like right there.  
 16 Q For the record, you're backing up the  
 17 video and you backed it up -- I'm sorry -- I have to  
 18 do this. You backed it up to count 16, and you're  
 19 welcome to go from there, Officer.  
 20 A How about we turn up the brightness?  
 21 Q I turned it up as high as it would go, I  
 22 thought.  
 23 A That's it.  
 24 Q There you go.  
 25 MR. REYNOLDS: For the record, he turned

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

111

1 up the brightness.  
 2 (Video started --  
 3 MR. MAURER: And, for the record, I  
 4 appreciate him doing that. You learn something  
 5 every day --  
 6 THE COURT REPORTER: I'm sorry, sir. I  
 7 didn't hear that --  
 8 THE WITNESS: -- right there. Right  
 9 there.  
 10 -- video interrupted.)  
 11 BY MR. MAURER:  
 12 Q Let's back up to where you think --  
 13 MR. COANT: Mary didn't hear the answer.  
 14 THE COURT REPORTER: I didn't hear that  
 15 answer; the very first part prior to right  
 16 there, right there.  
 17 THE WITNESS: I will repeat it again,  
 18 ma'am.  
 19 (Video started --  
 20 MR. MAURER: For the record, the witness  
 21 is going back and forth in the video --  
 22 THE WITNESS: It appears at the 18th  
 23 second of this video I'm motioning for  
 24 Carpenter to turn left.  
 25 BY MR. MAURER:

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

112

1 Q Okay. And now we're at section 20 --  
 2 A Section 20 --  
 3 Q I'm sorry -- second 20 --  
 4 A -- holding both hands, which appears to be  
 5 a motion to stop and, obviously, I'm approaching his  
 6 vehicle with more hand signals to put his phone  
 7 down, which he refuses twice. You can hear him say,  
 8 no, I don't have to, so, apparently --  
 9 -- video interrupted.)  
 10 BY MR. MAURER:  
 11 Q So, Officer, with that as background, I  
 12 just want to back up to the segment of the video  
 13 that you indicated was you holding both hands up. I  
 14 just want to do this very slowly here because maybe  
 15 I'm not seeing what you're seeing, and I appreciate  
 16 your turning the brightness all the way up.  
 17 Officer, we are now at 19.  
 18 A It looks like 20 to me.  
 19 Q 20. Thank you. And are you saying you  
 20 have both hands up in this image?  
 21 (Video started --  
 22 THE WITNESS: That's where I motioned for  
 23 him to stop.  
 24 BY MR. MAURER:  
 25 Q Officer, the video --

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR



1 A Yeah, there's -- there's a section  
 2 missing.  
 3 -- video interrupted.)  
 4 BY MR. MAURER:  
 5 Q Officer, you'd agree after having had the  
 6 opportunity to review this video several times, with  
 7 the lighting turned all the way up, that it doesn't  
 8 show you holding both hands up in the air; does it?  
 9 What you saw may have been a reflection from a sign  
 10 or something, but it's not --  
 11 A Excuse me --  
 12 Q -- not both hands up.  
 13 A A reflection from a sign?  
 14 Q Yes. I'll ask it again. This --  
 15 A No --  
 16 Q -- video doesn't show you holding --  
 17 A It looks like I'm motioning telling him to  
 18 stop.  
 19 (Video started --  
 20 THE WITNESS: I'm motioning to turn left.  
 21 I just did that. I just held up both hands.  
 22 BY MR. MAURER:  
 23 Q Show us where --  
 24 A That's what it looks like to me.  
 25 Q Sir, we have to take turns here.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

115

1 correct?  
 2 A No.  
 3 Q You held both arms up to like waist  
 4 height.  
 5 A It looks like I did this. That's what it  
 6 looks like on the video.  
 7 Q You think you put both hands out facing  
 8 the vehicle?  
 9 A That's what the video portrays.  
 10 Q That's your interpretation of it.  
 11 A Why else would I do that?  
 12 Q We will just have to get this enlarged  
 13 then and put into still images. I suppose that's  
 14 the only way to really answer this conclusively.  
 15 Officer, I'd like to take a short break  
 16 because I think we've been going for almost two  
 17 hours and then we will resume.  
 18 (Short recess taken.)  
 19 BY MR. MAURER:  
 20 Q We are back on the record of your  
 21 deposition, Patrolman Chard, and we're going to  
 22 shift gears briefly as far as lawyers. My  
 23 colleague, Charles Coant, is going to conduct the  
 24 next portion of your examination because the machine  
 25 that he's going to be using to show you a video he's

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 A Whoops.  
 2 Q Stop it where you think it shows you  
 3 holding up both hands.  
 4 (Video started; video interrupted.)  
 5 THE WITNESS: Right there. I can't really  
 6 get it.  
 7 (Video started; video interrupted.)  
 8 BY MR. MAURER:  
 9 Q So around --  
 10 A Right there.  
 11 Q 19 --  
 12 A I mean --  
 13 Q -- or 20 --  
 14 A I mean -- listen. You can, obviously, see  
 15 the intersection's closed, police officer in the  
 16 middle. Who are you going to be looking at?  
 17 Q Officer, let me just -- I just need to  
 18 finish up on the issues --  
 19 A Please do --  
 20 Q -- that we have raised looking at --  
 21 A Please do.  
 22 Q You indicated that at second 19 or 20 you  
 23 lifted both arms up into the air.  
 24 A That's what it looks like by your video.  
 25 Q You didn't hold them above your head;

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

116

1 more familiar with it than I am, so I will just turn  
 2 this over to Mr. Coant.  
 3 BY MR. COANT:  
 4 Q Okay. This is, Officer, the Rite-Aid  
 5 video. Have you seen this video, by the way?  
 6 A Yes.  
 7 Q Okay.  
 8 MR. COANT: Let's take a little recess  
 9 here.  
 10 MR. MAURER: All right.  
 11 (Short recess taken.)  
 12 BY MR. MAURER:  
 13 Q So, Patrolman Chard, what we are going to  
 14 do -- this is the Rite-Aid surveillance video that  
 15 you indicated you had seen previously; correct?  
 16 A Okay.  
 17 Q And, just as background, did you review  
 18 this video in the process of determining what  
 19 charges to file?  
 20 A No.  
 21 Q No? You reviewed this video later on?  
 22 A Yes.  
 23 Q As of result of this lawsuit being filed  
 24 that we are here for today?  
 25 A Yes.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 Q So since you have seen it, bear with us.  
 2 Mr. Coant is going to start it up and, first of all  
 3 --  
 4 MR. COANT: This is Mr. Carpenter's  
 5 pick-up truck right here; all right?  
 6 THE WITNESS: Okay.  
 7 BY MR. MAURER:  
 8 Q And the count is 15:15.05 at the top.  
 9 We're going to roll this for awhile.  
 10 (Video started; video interrupted.)  
 11 MR. MAURER: Stop it here.  
 12 BY MR. MAURER:  
 13 Q Officer, if we look to like the top middle  
 14 and a little bit to the right of the middle, would  
 15 you agree that that shows Mr. Carpenter's pick-up  
 16 turning left onto Foundry?  
 17 A Yes.  
 18 Q And that the figure we see in the Hi-Vis  
 19 safety vest is you?  
 20 A Yes.  
 21 Q The view that we are looking at at  
 22 15:15.16, does that show you being dragged through  
 23 the intersection?  
 24 A Well, currently the video is stopped --  
 25 Q Okay --

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 A -- so I don't know what it's exactly  
 2 showing.  
 3 Q All right.  
 4 MR. COANT: Are you ready?  
 5 BY MR. MAURER:  
 6 Q We'll play it some more then.  
 7 (Video started; video interrupted.)  
 8 MR. MAURER: Stop it here.  
 9 BY MR. MAURER:  
 10 Q Now, Officer, I know the video --  
 11 A It shows the event.  
 12 Q I'm sorry?  
 13 A I said, yes, it showed the event.  
 14 Q It showed the event, and the last few  
 15 moments we saw before stopping the camera showed you  
 16 positioned at some distance away from Carpenter's  
 17 truck; correct?  
 18 A After he pulled away.  
 19 Q And what we just looked at did that show  
 20 you getting dragged through the intersection?  
 21 A Yes.  
 22 Q But you would agree with me that in this  
 23 view as in the one we looked at previously there's  
 24 no indication that you fell off your feet; correct?  
 25 A Correct.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

119

1 MR. MAURER: Why don't we back this up one  
 2 more time?  
 3 BY MR. MAURER:  
 4 Q I am going to ask you to take one more  
 5 look at this.  
 6 (Video started; video interrupted.)  
 7 BY MR. MAURER:  
 8 Q Now, we're looking at a still image of  
 9 15:15.12. Do you see yourself? I realize it's not  
 10 the best image up there on top.  
 11 A I have to position this so my attorney can  
 12 see as well.  
 13 Q Very good.  
 14 MR. COANT: Yes.  
 15 BY MR. MAURER:  
 16 Q Do you see yourself in the Hi-Vis vest off  
 17 to the side of Carpenter's truck?  
 18 A Yes.  
 19 Q And, to your recollection, does that show  
 20 you before the claim that you were dragged or after?  
 21 A It looks like before.  
 22 Q Before. Okay.  
 23 MR. MAURER: Why don't we play it from  
 24 here?  
 25 (Video started; video interrupted.)

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

120

1 MR. MAURER: And stop it.  
 2 BY MR. REYNOLDS:  
 3 Q We are now at 15:15.21. Tell us what you  
 4 saw in that sequence; just the few seconds we just  
 5 looked at.  
 6 A I saw the described event take place.  
 7 Q And what we just looked at in your version  
 8 of -- well, I'm sorry. According to you, what we  
 9 just saw shows you being dragged?  
 10 A Yes. It showed the event take place.  
 11 Q And at this point, 15:15.21, the incident  
 12 of you being dragged is over and done with; correct?  
 13 A Correct.  
 14 Q You didn't have any cuts or scrapes as a  
 15 result of this; correct?  
 16 A Correct.  
 17 Q You didn't get any medical attention on  
 18 scene from a brother officer?  
 19 A Correct.  
 20 Q All right. And, aside from this -- I'll  
 21 call it the Rite-Aid video -- have you taken a look  
 22 at any other videos related to this incident?  
 23 A Yes.  
 24 Q And what video was that?  
 25 A From the adjacent store.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR



1 Q From the 7/11?

2 A 7/11.

3 Q We may or may not get to that, but I think

4 we're done for this video for now.

5 MR. MAURER: We are up to Chard-5?

6 THE COURT REPORTER: We are.

7 (Qual-Lynx Discovery Documentation Packet

8 marked as Exhibit Chard-5 for identification.)

9 BY MR. MAURER:

10 Q Officer, we are back on the record, and we

11 have handed you a packet of documents that we have

12 labeled Chard-5. We got these in discovery from a

13 provider called Qual-Lynx, Q-U-A-L dash L-Y-N-X. I

14 just want to ask you about a few of these pages.

15 We're not going to talk about the entire packet, and

16 I want to start by focusing on the first two pages,

17 and I wrote page numbers in for reference. You will

18 see them at the bottom of the second page.

19 This first page is on the letterhead of

20 Premier Orthopaedic Associates; correct --

21 A Yes --

22 Q -- at the top of the page --

23 A -- that's what it says, yes.

24 Q All right. And you recognize that name as

25 a medical provider for you?

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 A Yes.

2 Q And your name is on the upper right hand

3 side of the page?

4 A Yes.

5 Q And under your data it says, PROGRESS

6 NOTE: Fred McAlpin, DO, and some other letters. Do

7 you recall seeing a Doctor McAlpin?

8 A Where does it say that? Oh, I see it.

9 Q To the right of PROGRESS NOTES.

10 A Yes. It's hardly legible, but I see it.

11 Q I can't control the quality of the

12 documents.

13 A All right.

14 Q Do you recall --

15 A Yes. I saw Doctor McAlpin for my

16 shoulder.

17 Q And are you still under his care?

18 A No.

19 Q The date of this document off to the left

20 is February 2nd of '18. Do you see that?

21 A Uh huh. Yes, I see it.

22 Q A year and a month ago, give or take.

23 A Okay.

24 Q And working down the document, the reason

25 for the appointment is right shoulder pain. Do you

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

123

1 see that?

2 A Yes.

3 Q And under his History of Present Illness

4 -- I'll read this into the record. Albert presents

5 today for a follow up evaluation of his right

6 shoulder. He states the shoulder is feeling a

7 little sore. He is working full duty.

8 Accurate that you were working full duty

9 as of February 2nd of '18?

10 A Yes.

11 Q And that would have been 11 days after

12 this incident?

13 A Correct.

14 Q Did you ever not work full duty after the

15 incident occurred?

16 A No, not to my knowledge.

17 Q You stayed on full duty?

18 A Correct. After being cleared, of course.

19 Q After being cleared.

20 A Uh huh.

21 Q And you were cleared to remain on full

22 duty the date of the incident; correct?

23 MR. REYNOLDS: Say that again, please.

24 BY MR. MAURER:

25 Q You were cleared to remain on full duty on

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

124

1 the day of the incident?

2 MR. REYNOLDS: By whom?

3 MR. MAURER: He said he was cleared and I

4 will ask for clarification.

5 BY MR. MAURER:

6 Q Who cleared you, Patrolman Chard?

7 A Premier Orthopaedic Associates. Doctor

8 McAlpin.

9 Q The same provider that we see here?

10 A Apparently, according to the paperwork.

11 Q We may have a little confusion here,

12 Patrolman. It could be the questions that I am

13 asking you.

14 A Okay.

15 Q The incident we know is January 22nd of

16 '18; correct?

17 A Correct.

18 Q And you say you were dragged across the

19 intersection. We've talked about that.

20 A Yep. We have talked about it.

21 Q After that incident was your duty status

22 changed?

23 A Well, technically, I was removed from

24 duty, but I was cleared the next day. I showed up

25 for work as normal with shoulder pain.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 Q All right.  
 2 A As I have previously described, somewhere  
 3 in the records.  
 4 Q Okay.  
 5 A I couldn't tell you where it is.  
 6 Q Briefly, Patrolman, your recollection is  
 7 that you were removed from duty after the incident  
 8 on the 22nd; is that accurate?  
 9 A Correct. Yes.  
 10 Q And what was the reason for your removal  
 11 from duty?  
 12 A You have to be cleared by occupational  
 13 health before you can be returned to full duty and  
 14 be put on the road again.  
 15 Q And your recollection is you were cleared  
 16 the following day.  
 17 A The following day.  
 18 Q January 23rd?  
 19 A Yeah. Yes. It would have been the 23rd.  
 20 That's after the 22nd.  
 21 Q And then the document we're looking at  
 22 here, Chard-5, is the record of a follow-up visit  
 23 with Doctor McAlpin?  
 24 A It appears to be.  
 25 Q All right.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 A It's dated several days later.  
 2 Q And let's just turn to page 2. There's a  
 3 section that says Treatment, and I just want to read  
 4 the note into the record. He demonstrates trace  
 5 residual symptoms. The he is yourself; correct?  
 6 A Well, should be.  
 7 Q And the trace residual symptoms; do you  
 8 have any understanding of what Doctor McAlpin meant  
 9 by that phrase?  
 10 A You would have to ask him.  
 11 Q Very well.  
 12 MR. REYNOLDS: And it does say I will  
 13 clear him for regular work duties on the  
 14 sentence after you read --  
 15 MR. MAURER: I'm happy to ask that as well  
 16 --  
 17 MR. REYNOLDS: Okay --  
 18 MR. MAURER: -- since the witness directed  
 19 me towards Doctor McAlpin. I can do that.  
 20 BY MR. MAURER:  
 21 Q The next sentence, I will clear him for  
 22 regular work duties. If I understand your  
 23 testimony, Patrolman, you were already cleared for  
 24 regular work duties before this February 2nd of '18  
 25 date?

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

127

1 A Well, if this is a follow-up, then that  
 2 would be after the initial visit; wouldn't it?  
 3 Q And you agreed with me that this is a  
 4 follow-up visit; correct?  
 5 A According to the date, yes.  
 6 Q All right. Now, the next sentence. He  
 7 will be seen on an as needed basis only if the pain  
 8 persists beyond March.  
 9 Did you see Doctor McAlpin again, to your  
 10 knowledge, after this February 2nd visit?  
 11 A Not that I remember.  
 12 Q The last sentence. He'll be placed at  
 13 maximal medical improvement.  
 14 Do you have any understanding of what that  
 15 phrase means?  
 16 A Well, without knowing what Doctor McAlpin  
 17 means by it, my interpretation would be I wouldn't  
 18 improve anymore. I have improved the most that I  
 19 can be improved.  
 20 Q And just so I am certain, you are not  
 21 under the care of any orthopedic doctor for a right  
 22 shoulder injury as of today; correct?  
 23 A Correct.  
 24 Q Are you right handed or left handed?  
 25 A Right handed.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

128

1 Q We're done with that exhibit for now, and  
 2 I just want to move on to a few other questions so,  
 3 if you'd like, we can put that aside.  
 4 A Go ahead.  
 5 Q If you want to keep reading the document  
 6 while I ask you questions that's fine with me as  
 7 well.  
 8 Officer, is there any part of your duties  
 9 as a patrolman that you can't do today that you  
 10 could do before the incident date?  
 11 A Not to my knowledge.  
 12 Q Do you have any plans to change your  
 13 employment or your residence at any point later this  
 14 year in 2019?  
 15 A Not that I know of.  
 16 Q Your plan is to stick around and continue  
 17 to be a Millville police officer?  
 18 A Yes. Is that okay with you?  
 19 Q Absolutely. I'm just asking, and the  
 20 reason I'm asking, Officer, is that this case is on  
 21 the track to go to trial, and I'm just trying to  
 22 make sure that you are going to be around when that  
 23 happens.  
 24 A Okay.  
 25 Q Officer, you would agree with me that as a

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR



1 result of this incident, Mr. Carpenter was charged  
2 with aggravated assault of a police officer?

3 A Yes.

4 Q And he was indicted for that offense?

5 A Yes.

6 Q And on April 2nd of 2018 that indictment  
7 was dismissed; correct?

8 A I don't know the exact date, but it was  
9 dismissed.

10 Q And --

11 A Unknown to my knowledge why.

12 Q Well, you would agree that the Cumberland  
13 County Prosecutor dismissed the indictment because  
14 they found there was no factual support for the  
15 charge of aggravated assault on a police officer.

16 A I was not given an explanation.

17 Q You don't have any understanding sitting  
18 here today as to why that indictment was dismissed.  
19 Is that what you're telling me?

20 A I was never sent official notice why it  
21 was dismissed.

22 Q That being the case, Officer, we'll take a  
23 look at another document.

24 MR. MAURER: We're going to mark this as  
25 Chard-6.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 (4/2/18 Plea Hearing and Sentence

2 Transcript marked as Exhibit Chard-6 for  
3 identification.)

4 BY MR. MAURER:

5 Q And, Officer Chard, I apologize. I don't  
6 have extra copies of this document. However, your  
7 lawyer is welcome to look on with you --

8 MR. REYNOLDS: I have it here.

9 MR. MAURER: All right. Very good. And  
10 my colleague should have one and, if not --

11 MR. COANT: I have it --

12 MR. MAURER: -- I'll show it to him later.

13 THE WITNESS: What document?

14 BY MR. MAURER:

15 Q The document that is in front of you.

16 A This document here?

17 Q Yes. We've marked it as Chard-6.

18 A We were looking over other papers so I  
19 didn't know if you meant this document or another  
20 document.

21 Q I did mean that document. As we can see  
22 here, it's a transcript from Superior Court of New  
23 Jersey, Cumberland County, proceedings on the  
24 indictment that was filed against Mr. Chard;  
25 correct?

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

131

1 A Can you repeat that?

2 Q Sure. You're seeing on the very first  
3 page, upper right hand corner, confirmation that  
4 this is a transcript of proceedings in the State of  
5 New Jersey versus David Carpenter; correct?

6 A Okay. Yes.

7 Q And we can further see, in the upper right  
8 hand corner, this is relating to the indictment that  
9 had been filed against Mr. Carpenter?

10 A That's what it says. I don't know the  
11 indictment number by heart.

12 Q You're not aware of any indictment against  
13 Mr. Carpenter other than the one that was filed  
14 based on the incident; are you?

15 A No.

16 Q I want you to turn, if you would, to page  
17 4 and 5 of this record, and I am showing you what it  
18 looks like just for your reference. There's a 4 at  
19 the top and there's a 5 halfway down, and I'd ask  
20 you to just take a glance at that.

21 You've had a chance to look through that?

22 A Are you aware that the original charges  
23 were not indictable charges?

24 Q I am, Officer, and --

25 A Okay --

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

132

1 Q -- they became indicted charges; correct?

2 A Correct.

3 Q They became indicted charges after you  
4 testified to the grand jury on February 7th --

5 A They became indictable charges before I  
6 testified because they were upgraded by the  
7 prosecutor's office, as far as I know.

8 Q And you testified in support of those  
9 charges on February 7 of 2017; correct?

10 A Correct.

11 Q Now, we've fast forwarded to April 2nd,  
12 and you've had a chance to review page 4? That's  
13 the tabbed page.

14 A Okay.

15 Q And, Officer, I just want to read one part  
16 of this into the record; a statement by Prosecutor  
17 Hernon.

18 "I believe he was indicted for aggravated  
19 assault on a law enforcement officer as one of the  
20 offenses and, again, there was, in the State's view,  
21 no factual for that."

22 Now, the sentence I just read to you, the  
23 reference to law enforcement officer is a reference  
24 to you; correct?

25 A Yeah. Yes, I guess it would be. In the

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 State.  
2 Q And in the State's view means in the view  
3 of the State of New Jersey; correct?

4 A That's what it should mean.

5 MR. REYNOLDS: Again, I am going to  
6 object. You're reading a sentence out of  
7 context with the entirety of the paragraph  
8 where the prosecutor states there was a basis  
9 to arrest --

10 MR. MAURER: Counsel --

11 MR. REYNOLDS: -- Mr. Carpenter.

12 MR. MAURER: Counsel, the document speaks  
13 for itself and you are engaging in a behavior  
14 that Hall versus Clifton Precision says you're  
15 not supposed to.

16 MR. REYNOLDS: Well, I am trying to make  
17 the record fair for the officer. You're  
18 pulling out bits and pieces of documents that I  
19 think are not --

20 MR. MAURER: Counsel, that's why --

21 MR. REYNOLDS: -- completely in context.

22 MR. MAURER: That's why the entire  
23 document is being made an exhibit. Nothing is  
24 hidden. Nothing is kept under the carpet.  
25 It's all in front of this witness.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 MR. REYNOLDS: Well, I'm referencing  
2 questions; not the documents.

3 MR. MAURER: Counsel, my questions don't  
4 have to incorporate questions that you think  
5 are appropriate. That's why you're here.

6 BY MR. MAURER:

7 Q Officer, we can agree that in the State's  
8 view there was no factual support for the charge of  
9 aggravated assault on a law enforcement officer --

10 MR. REYNOLDS: Objection --

11 BY MR. MAURER:

12 Q -- correct --

13 MR. REYNOLDS: -- calls for speculation.

14 He said he wasn't consulted. He doesn't know.

15 MR. MAURER: Counsel, I'm going to move --

16 I may move to strike your objections and bring  
17 this witness back because you're going beyond  
18 the scope.

19 MR. REYNOLDS: Well, I do believe this

20 last question was particularly objectionable

21 based on his prior answers.

22 BY MR. MAURER:

23 Q Officer --

24 MR. REYNOLDS: He -- go ahead --

25 BY MR. MAURER:

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

135

1 Q -- Dennis Hernon is the person who made  
2 that statement that I just read into the record;  
3 correct? And we can see his name on the very first  
4 page of this exhibit --

5 A I see a Dennis Hernon --

6 Q -- identified as attorney on behalf of the  
7 state --

8 A Okay --

9 Q -- of New Jersey; correct?

10 A That's what it says.

11 Q And you have no reason to believe that's  
12 not true.

13 A Not today.

14 Q Officer, you didn't have any disagreement  
15 with the decision to indict Mr. Carpenter; correct?

16 A It wasn't my decision that was made.

17 Q Whoever ultimately made that decision,  
18 sir, you didn't --

19 A I was just asked to come and I testified  
20 according to the questions that were asked of me.

21 Q And you had no objection to Mr. Carpenter  
22 being indicted; correct?

23 MR. REYNOLDS: Objection.

24 BY MR. MAURER:

25 Q You can answer.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

136

1 MR. REYNOLDS: He already has, but go  
2 ahead.

3 BY MR. MAURER:

4 Q You had no problem with that; did you?

5 A No, I didn't.

6 Q You thought he deserved it.

7 A Well, this case went up to the  
8 prosecutor's office and they made their decisions.

9 Q Based, at least in part, on testimony that  
10 you gave; correct?

11 A They made the decision before my  
12 testimony.

13 Q Okay. So, Patrolman, your under --

14 A Maybe --

15 Q If I could just ask the question.

16 A Go ahead.

17 Q Your understanding is that the decision to  
18 indict Mr. Carpenter had been made regardless of  
19 your testimony?

20 A The charges were upgraded without my  
21 knowledge; okay? I was asked to come and testify.  
22 I testified, answered the questions, which were  
23 true.

24 Q And I believe you just indicated you were  
25 fine with him being indicted.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR



MR. REYNOLDS: Objection; irrelevant. You can answer.

THE WITNESS: I believe I already answered you.

BY MR. MAURER:

Q Officer, we'll look at one more exhibit.

Officer, we are moving on to a different exhibit --

MR. MAURER: -- and this one is going to be marked as Chard-7.

(6/22/18 Civil Cover Sheet w/ Attached

Complaint and Jury Demand marked as Exhibit Chard-7 for identification.)

BY MR. MAURER:

Q Officer Chard, I am showing you what's been marked as Chard-7, and I am showing you a page from one of the exhibits to Chard-7, the complaint in this action, and you will see it's page 31 of 35.

I'm sorry, sir. I know you're still looking at the previous exhibit, but I would like to move on to the next one. Are you okay with that?

A Well, seeing this is the first time I'm seeing this exhibit I want to look at it.

MR. REYNOLDS: He's referring to the grand jury transcript.

BY MR. MAURER:

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

Q So sticking with that testimony,

Officer -- I'm sorry. If you wouldn't -- given your testimony, we can stick with Chard-6 for awhile.

Patrolman, I'd like you to put Chard-7 away and look at Chard-6 --

A Didn't you just tell me wanted me to look at Chard-7?

Q Right, but then your lawyer had something to say and so did you, and I'd like to explore that.

A Go ahead.

Q Chard-6 is a transcript of grand jury testimony; correct -- I'm sorry. It's a transcript

--

A Incorrect.

Q As I was about to correct myself, it's a transcript of proceedings in Superior Court before Judge Silvanio on April 2nd of 2018, at which point, the charge of aggravated assault of a police officer was dismissed by the state, and you're saying you've never seen this document before?

A This document right here?

Q The transcript, April 2nd of 2018 --

A Correct. I've never seen it.

Q You never saw it before?

A I've established that already.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

139

MR. REYNOLDS: I'm sorry. I misspoke when

I made a prior comment about what he was reviewing.

BY MR. MAURER:

Q That's not a document that you reviewed after you were named a defendant in this action?

A No.

Q You never saw it before today?

A Like I already said several times, I've never seen this document before today and before you handed it to me. Actually, before she handed it to me; okay?

Q We can agree on its content, though?

A According to what?

Q According to what it says on the printed page.

A That's what it says.

Q Thanks. We can now move on to the next exhibit.

A Okay.

Q Patrolman Chard, since you seem to have some reluctance to move on to the next exhibit, I'll pull the exhibit. Let's not even worry about it. I will withdraw the exhibit.

A Let's go.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

140

Q I withdraw the exhibit.

A Let's go.

Q Officer, I'm not going to ask you questions --

A Listen. If you don't want to give me time to review a document I've never seen before, that's fine. Let's move on.

Q Are you saying you need more time to review Chard-6?

A No, I'm good. Let's move on.

Q All right. And we will move on with questions that actually don't depend on that exhibit, which is why I'm withdrawing it.

You testified in front of the grand jury; correct?

A That would be correct.

Q And as we -- as you have agreed, the date of your testimony was February 7th of 2018?

A I don't know the date.

Q Okay. Since, apparently, we're sticking with Chard-7, and I can do that too, Officer, let's back up a few pages from what I tabbed.

A I'm just reading what you wanted me to read originally --

Q Officer --

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 A -- but now, apparently, you don't.  
 2 Q Right, because in response to your  
 3 questions I'm trying to move this along.  
 4 Officer, I'm going to show you what I want  
 5 to ask you questions about, and I'll do it at a  
 6 distance so I don't bother you or your lawyer.  
 7 Officer, would you mind looking at what I  
 8 am showing you? What I am showing you is a face  
 9 sheet of grand jury testimony.  
 10 A Okay.  
 11 Q It's a few pages back in the packet from  
 12 the page that I have tabbed. Please turn to this  
 13 page.  
 14 A In this packet?  
 15 Q Correct. Thank you. The page we are  
 16 looking at here is dated February 7 of 2018;  
 17 correct, about 18 days after this happened?  
 18 A Yes. It says February 7th, 2018.  
 19 Q And the testimony that is recorded in this  
 20 transcript is yours; correct?  
 21 A That's what it says.  
 22 Q And you've seen this document before  
 23 today.  
 24 A No, I have not.  
 25 Q Have you reviewed the complaint that was

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 filed against you in this action?  
 2 A I believe I received it and I don't  
 3 remember if I went through it or not.  
 4 Q You do remember being placed under oath  
 5 and testifying before the grand jury?  
 6 A Yes, I do.  
 7 Q And you would agree with me that what you  
 8 said is accurately recorded in the transcript that's  
 9 in front of you?  
 10 A I haven't read through it so...  
 11 Q Well, to move this along, Officer, if we  
 12 could simply go to the tabbed page, which is page 5,  
 13 I'm just going to read a few of these sentences into  
 14 the record.  
 15 The first one at the bottom half of page 5  
 16 is a question. While you were holding the door  
 17 handle, did he drive which dragged you across the  
 18 street?  
 19 That's a question you were asked by the  
 20 prosecutor; correct?  
 21 A Yes.  
 22 Q And your answer was?  
 23 A Yes.  
 24 Q And you were then asked were you directing  
 25 him to stop?

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. REYNOLDS

143

1 A Yes.  
 2 Q That was your answer?  
 3 A Yes.  
 4 Q The next question. Were you able to stay  
 5 on your feet and keep up with the car? Your answer  
 6 was? What was your answer?  
 7 A It says here, yes, I was.  
 8 Q All right. So your testimony, Officer,  
 9 today and back on February 7 of last year, is that  
 10 even though you were on your feet and keeping up  
 11 with the truck, that you were still, in your words,  
 12 dragged?  
 13 A Yes.  
 14 MR. MAURER: I have no further questions.  
 15 Your lawyer may have.  
 16 MR. REYNOLDS: I do have a few questions  
 17 to clarify.  
 18 BY MR. REYNOLDS:  
 19 Q Officer Chard, you never stated to anyone  
 20 that as a result of this incident you left your feet  
 21 and, otherwise, fell down when the truck was moving;  
 22 is that correct?  
 23 MR. MAURER: Objection --  
 24 THE WITNESS: That's correct --  
 25 MR. MAURER: -- leading. You can't lead

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. REYNOLDS

144

1 your own witness even in a deposition.  
 2 MR. REYNOLDS: Well, I am just clarifying  
 3 instances that you were asking about. In  
 4 fact --  
 5 MR. MAURER: You still can't lead your  
 6 witness in a deposition.  
 7 BY MR. REYNOLDS:  
 8 Q I refer you to the exhibit, Chard-5, that  
 9 you were handed by plaintiff's counsel, the pack of  
 10 medical records. If you refer to page 13 on the  
 11 bottom, please. Do you see that document, Officer?  
 12 A Page 13?  
 13 Q Yes.  
 14 A Yes, I have page 13.  
 15 Q Is this a record of your emergency room  
 16 record that same day?  
 17 MR. MAURER: Counsel, I'm going to  
 18 position myself so I can see the document  
 19 because I gave all my copies up during this --  
 20 THE WITNESS: Well, you handed it to me.  
 21 MR. MAURER: Exactly. Now you have it; I  
 22 don't.  
 23 THE WITNESS: Sir, what was your question  
 24 again?  
 25 BY MR. REYNOLDS:

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR



1 Q Okay. Is this record, page 13, to your  
2 knowledge, a record of your emergency room visit on  
3 the date of the accident, January 22nd?  
4 A It appears to be.  
5 Q Now, looking at the full paragraph towards  
6 the bottom of the page --  
7 A 23:12 --  
8 Q -- can you read into the record the  
9 sentence after HPI:, which I believe stands for his  
10 history of present illness? Read the next three  
11 sentences, please.  
12 A HPI: Patient is a 37 year old male who  
13 presents to the ER status post right arm injury. He  
14 states that he grabbed onto a car door handle and  
15 began moving -- and the car began moving. Sorry.  
16 He states the car pulled his arm. However, he was  
17 on his feet the whole time. He did not hit his head  
18 or lose consciousness. He did not fall directly to  
19 the ground. He is complaining of right shoulder,  
20 right elbow, right forearm and wrist pain. He did  
21 not take anything prior to arrival for pain. He  
22 denies, numbness, tingling -- tingling, cyanosis,  
23 decreased range of motion, swelling, ecchymosis,  
24 erythema, chest pain, shortness of breath, abdominal  
25 pain, nausea, vomiting. The patient has not

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 experienced similar symptoms in the past. The  
2 patient has not recently seen a physician.  
3 Q Thank you. Is that description of how  
4 this incident occurred accurate; that you grabbed  
5 onto a car door while the car was moving or began to  
6 move?  
7 A Yes.  
8 Q And that's how you injured your arm by the  
9 fact that the car pulled your arm; correct?  
10 MR. MAURER: Objection; leading --  
11 MR. REYNOLDS: Well --  
12 MR. MAURER: -- you can't lead your own  
13 witness.  
14 BY MR. REYNOLDS:  
15 Q You did state that sentence in your  
16 document to the doctor; correct?  
17 A I can read it right here too, which I've  
18 already read aloud.  
19 MR. MAURER: Patrolman, you can do  
20 whatever you want --  
21 THE WITNESS: I know --  
22 MR. MAURER: -- but I am instructing your  
23 lawyer, as he knows, that he can't ask you  
24 leading questions.  
25 MR. REYNOLDS: Okay.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. REYNOLDS

147

1 BY MR. REYNOLDS:  
2 Q Now, Officer, you were shown a  
3 surveillance video of a store that showed the  
4 incident; correct?  
5 A Correct.  
6 Q Have you also seen a second store  
7 surveillance video that showed the incident?  
8 A Correct.  
9 Q Did the second video, to your  
10 recollection, also show the incident with you  
11 holding onto the -- grabbing onto the handle of the  
12 door?  
13 A Yes.  
14 Q Officer, you filed your complaint in this  
15 case that you read; correct?  
16 MR. MAURER: Objection; leading. He  
17 indicated he hadn't read it.  
18 BY MR. MAURER:  
19 Q Did you prepare the complaint in this  
20 matter or --  
21 A Yes --  
22 Q -- the charges against Mr. Carpenter?  
23 A Yes.  
24 Q Did you charge him with an indictable  
25 offense?

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. REYNOLDS

148

1 A No. They should have been all DP  
2 offenses.  
3 Q Why do you say that?  
4 A Because that's how it -- he was charged as  
5 the incident happened to the severity that it  
6 happened.  
7 Q And that charge was assault by auto;  
8 correct?  
9 A Correct.  
10 Q That is a disorderly person's offense;  
11 correct?  
12 A Correct, to my knowledge.  
13 Q Were you notified by the prosecutor before  
14 your grand jury testimony that they wanted -- strike  
15 that. Who elevated the charge to an indictable  
16 offense?  
17 A To my knowledge, I don't know, other than  
18 the AP in charge of the case.  
19 Q It wasn't your decision to make it an  
20 indictable --  
21 A It was not --  
22 Q -- offense; correct?  
23 A Correct. It was not my decision.  
24 Q Okay. Based on your recollection of this  
25 incident, did you have reasonable or probable cause

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 to charge Mr. Carpenter with the offenses he was  
2 charged with that day?

3 MR. MAURER: Objection. Probable cause is  
4 a legal conclusion.

5 BY MR. REYNOLDS:

6 Q Did you have just cause?

7 A Yes.

8 MR. MAURER: That is too. Same thing.

9 BY MR. REYNOLDS:

10 Q Well, from your perspective as a police  
11 officer, did you have sufficient cause to charge Mr.  
12 Carpenter for all of the charges that were filed  
13 against him that day?

14 A Yes --

15 MR. MAURER: Objection. That's another  
16 take at probable cause, which is a legal  
17 conclusion.

18 BY MR. REYNOLDS:

19 Q As a police officer, do you have authority  
20 to charge individuals who commit offenses in your  
21 presence?

22 A Yes.

23 Q Did that occur in this case?

24 A Yes.

25 Q And do you stand by the three disorderly

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 person's charges and the four traffic summonses that  
2 you issued to Mr. Carpenter as legitimate and  
3 appropriate charges based on your position and  
4 experience as a police officer?

5 A Yes --

6 MR. MAURER: Objection; leading.

7 MR. REYNOLDS: No further questions.

8 BY MR. MAURER:

9 Q Patrolman Chard, you would agree with me  
10 that all of the charges against David Carpenter were  
11 withdrawn except the cell phone charge; correct?

12 A That's what I was told.

13 Q Officer, since your lawyer has mentioned  
14 some other videos, in the interest of completeness,  
15 I would like to take a look at some of those videos  
16 now.

17 We are going to start with another video  
18 that was provided in discovery. We are going to use  
19 my machine, as before the light is turned up, and I  
20 am going to start it and on occasion I am going to  
21 stop it and ask you questions.

22 The still image, and this is image  
23 2196.MOV, begins with a still image. We see Inspira  
24 Medical Center in the back, the sign.

25 A That's not what it says.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

151

1 Q There's a sign depicted in the back --

2 A It says Inspira Health Network Imaging  
3 Center; not Inspira Medical Center.

4 Q I appreciate the clarification.

5 MR. REYNOLDS: For the record, I did  
6 mention another video. I didn't mention  
7 another --

8 MR. MAURER: Well, Counsel --

9 MR. REYNOLDS: -- video, plural, but I am  
10 not objecting to you going through this --

11 MR. MAURER: -- in the interest of  
12 completeness, we will take a look at all the  
13 videos.

14 MR. REYNOLDS: That's fine.

15 BY MR. MAURER:

16 Q And we see here a still image of Sergeant  
17 Hoydis; correct?

18 A Correct.

19 Q And he was -- he had supervisory authority  
20 over you on the incident day?

21 A That's correct.

22 Q And sergeant, as you indicated, is a  
23 position that one can qualify for with a longer time  
24 on the force?

25 A Correct.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

152

1 Q And let's just watch a bit of Sergeant  
2 Hoydis's interactions with David Carpenter.

3 (Video started; video interrupted.)

4 BY MR. MAURER:

5 Q Now, based on what we've looked at so far,  
6 Patrolman, Sergeant Hoydis isn't yelling at David  
7 Carpenter; is he?

8 A No.

9 Q But that's the first thing you did when he  
10 rolled his window down. You yelled at him.

11 A Okay.

12 Q You would agree?

13 A Yes.

14 Q Patrolman, isn't a goal of any interaction  
15 with, as you said, an uncooperative suspect -- isn't  
16 a goal to de-escalate the situation?

17 A It can be.

18 Q Well, isn't that what the officer should  
19 be trying to do?

20 A Well, first you have to meet the situation  
21 head-on.

22 Q And you met the situation head-on by  
23 yelling at Mr. Carpenter and asking if he wanted to  
24 be arrested?

25 MR. REYNOLDS: Objection --

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR



1 THE WITNESS: Well --  
 2 MR. REYNOLDS: -- it's not the foundation  
 3 or facts of this case.  
 4 MR. MAURER: That's -- okay. We've got  
 5 more standing, speaking objections. That was  
 6 the witness's own testimony, meet the situation  
 7 head-on, so I asked him --  
 8 BY MR. MAURER:  
 9 Q -- do you meet the situation head-on by  
 10 yelling at the suspect and asking if he wants to be  
 11 arrested? That's how you met the situation head-on?  
 12 A At this time I did. He asked me if I  
 13 wanted a lawsuit so, apparently --  
 14 (Video started; video interrupted.)  
 15 BY MR. MAURER:  
 16 Q I just stopped the video.  
 17 A There you go.  
 18 Q We watched a short portion --  
 19 A It's pretty self-explanatory right there.  
 20 Q Well, you would agree with me, Patrolman,  
 21 that at no point does Sergeant Hoydis raise his  
 22 voice to David Carpenter?  
 23 A He doesn't have the first interaction with  
 24 him.  
 25 Q But you would agree --

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

1 A And he didn't feel threatened by him  
 2 because the vehicle was already stopped and he  
 3 wasn't being told no by him.  
 4 Q Patrolman, you would agree --  
 5 A So --  
 6 Q -- you would agree with me that at no  
 7 point does Sergeant Hoydis raise his voice at David  
 8 Carpenter; correct?  
 9 A That's correct.  
 10 Q His responses to him were primarily the  
 11 word okay. You heard that; right?  
 12 A Yes.  
 13 Q That's an experienced police officer we  
 14 just saw; correct? Do you know how long Sergeant  
 15 Hoydis has been with the force?  
 16 A Roughly I do.  
 17 Q How long?  
 18 A At least 15 years.  
 19 Q You told us at the beginning of the  
 20 deposition that you began your training on March 4  
 21 of '16?  
 22 A That's correct.  
 23 Q Less than two years before this incident?  
 24 A That would be correct.  
 25 Q And, finally, Patrolman, why don't we move

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

155

1 on to the final video that your lawyer mentioned?  
 2 (Discussion off the record.)  
 3 BY MR. MAURER:  
 4 Q Now, back on the record, as before --  
 5 Patrolman, this is a different machine. We are  
 6 going to start with the still image of the video.  
 7 For the record, we are looking at a still  
 8 image of the video that on the left hand says 7/11,  
 9 1/22/18 --  
 10 A It's turned to you and I can't see it.  
 11 Q I am doing my best, Officer.  
 12 A You always --  
 13 Q Move it up then.  
 14 A Okay. Continue.  
 15 Q Better?  
 16 A Yes, I can see it now.  
 17 Q And you have seen this video before?  
 18 A Briefly.  
 19 Q What do you mean by briefly? More than  
 20 once?  
 21 A I have seen it maybe twice.  
 22 Q Okay.  
 23 A I wasn't counting. I mean...  
 24 Q And at the bottom we see a date of 1/22/18  
 25 and a stopped time of 3:15.04; correct?

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

CHARD - BY MR. MAURER

156

1 A That's what it says.  
 2 Q I just need to establish that.  
 3 MR. MAURER: And why don't we start the  
 4 video running?  
 5 MR. COANT: There's his pick-up truck. We  
 6 will stop it there.  
 7 BY MR. MAURER:  
 8 Q Now, Officer, in the last few seconds  
 9 we've looked at, and we're now at 3:15.11, you can  
 10 see David Carpenter's red 1994 pick-up truck  
 11 approaching the intersection of High and Foundry  
 12 Streets; correct?  
 13 A Correct.  
 14 Q And, now, it's at this point starting to  
 15 turn left.  
 16 MR. MAURER: Let's roll the video some  
 17 more. Stop the video.  
 18 BY MR. MAURER:  
 19 Q Officer, we are now at a time mark of  
 20 3:15.18, approximately three seconds after where we  
 21 stopped before. What you just looked at; did that  
 22 show you being dragged?  
 23 A Yes.  
 24 Q And you would agree at the point we are  
 25 now looking at, 3:15.18, this dragging had come to a

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

stop?

A Yes.  
 MR. MAURER: Nothing further.  
 MR. REYNOLDS: Thank you.  
 MR. MAURER: Anything further?  
 MR. REYNOLDS: I am done. Thank you.  
 MR. MAURER: All right. Patrolman, thanks  
 for coming in.  
 (Deposition concluded at 1:50 p.m.)  
 \*\*\*\*\*

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR

C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-I-O-N

STATE OF NEW JERSEY :  
 COUNTY OF CUMBERLAND :  
 I, MARY Q. IRELAN, Certified Court  
 Reporter, Registered Professional Reporter and  
 Notary Public, do hereby certify that I reported the  
 deposition in the above captioned matter; that  
 the said witness was duly sworn by me; that the  
 foregoing is a true and correct transcript of the  
 stenographic notes taken by me in the above  
 captioned matter.

I further certify that I am not an  
 attorney or counsel of any of the parties, nor a  
 relative or employee of any attorney or counsel  
 connected with this action, nor financially  
 interested in the action.

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR, RPR  
 License CCR # 1001515  
 License RPR # 008090

MARCH 22, 2019  
 DATE

(This Certification does not apply to any  
 reproduction of this transcript, unless under the  
 direct supervision of the certifying reporter.)

MARY Q. IRELAN, CCR



## **EXHIBIT 6**

**(Confidential – Copy Sent on Flash Drive to Chambers)**

## **EXHIBIT 7**

**(Confidential – Copies Sent on Flash Drive to Chambers)**